United Nations E/CN.3/2008/29

Economic and Social Council

Distr.: General
12 December 2007

Original: English

Statistical Commission
Thirty-ninth session
26-29 February 2008
Item 4 (n) of the provisional agenda*
Items for information: development indicators

Report of the Secretary-General on the indicators for monitoring the Millennium Development Goals

Report of the Secretary-General

Summary

The present report describes the work of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators in 2007 and the United Nations Statistics Division, in its capacity as coordinator of the Group, in the following areas: improvement of the coverage, transparency and reporting on all indicators as presented in the database on all Millennium Development Goals; implementation of the recommendations contained in Economic and Social Council resolution 2006/6 on strengthening statistical capacity, adopted in July 2006; coordination of data collection at the global level; and preparation of the yearly analysis and reports on progress towards the Millennium Development Goals. The report is presented for information. The Statistical Commission may wish to take note of the report.

* E/CN.3/2008/1.

07-64044 (E) 070108

Contents

		Paragraphs	*Page*
I.	Introduction	1–2	3
II.	Revised framework for the global monitoring of the Millennium Development Goals	3–5	3
III.	Improving data quality and transparency of methods	6–11	4
IV.	Enabling countries to have the necessary data and methodologies to monitor Millennium Development Goals at the national level	12	5
V.	Outputs by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators in 2007	13–17	6
VI.	Conclusions and way forward	18–19	6
Annexes			
I.	Revised Millennium Development Goals monitoring framework, including new targets and indicators		8
II.	Assessment of country data availability in the Millennium Development Goals indicators database		13
III.	Summary of the recommendations by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group at its 12th meeting, held in Paris from 14 to 16 November 2007		20

I. Introduction

1. At its thirty-seventh session, the Statistical Commission requested the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators to take into account the relevant recommendations of the friends of the Chair to improve further the compilation of the indicators used in the monitoring of the Goals and report to the Commission on progress achieved (see E/2006/24, chap. I.C, decision 37/111). Moreover, in July 2006, the Economic and Social Council adopted its resolution 2006/6 on strengthening statistical capacity in countries and included a set of recommendations to improve the coverage, transparency and reporting on all indicators. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group has, since then, been working to implement the recommendations of the friends of the Chair and those contained in the Council resolution. The present report outlines the progress made to address all the concerns raised and the activities undertaken by the Group in 2007.

2. At the 2005 World Summit, world leaders committed themselves to achieving four targets additional to the ones included in the Millennium Declaration.[1] The Inter-Agency and Expert Group undertook work to identify the most appropriate indicators to monitor progress towards the new targets. The present report describes the work done in this area and developments in the area of Millennium Development Goals monitoring. The annexes to the report contain information on the revised Millennium Development Goals monitoring frameworks (annex I), an assessment of country data availability in the Millennium Development Goals indicators database (annex II) and a summary of the recommendations by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group at its 12th meeting (annex III).

II. Revised framework for the global monitoring of the Millennium Development Goals

3. Since 2002, progress towards the Millennium Development Goals has been regularly monitored on the basis of the Millennium Development Goals monitoring framework, as agreed by the General Assembly in 2001 in its resolution 56/95. In September 2006, the Secretary-General, in paragraph 24 of his report on the work of the Organization (A/62/1), recommended the incorporation of the four new targets, as derived from the World Summit Outcome, and indicated that the technical work for the selection of the appropriate indicators would be undertaken by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators. Following the recommendations by the Secretary-General, the Group initiated work to identify the most appropriate indicators to monitor progress in the four new targets. The work was undertaken through the Group's thematic subgroups in the respective areas of responsibility.

4. The recommendations of the subgroups were reviewed and discussed by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group and presented to the Office of the Secretary-General for inclusion in his report to the General Assembly at its sixty-second session. The new framework, containing the four new targets, originally recommended for inclusion by the Secretary-General in his 2006 report, and the related indicators, as recommended by the Group at its last meeting, in March 2007, was presented to the

[1] See resolution 55/2.

Assembly in the report of the Secretary-General on the work of the Organization (A/62/1). Member States took note of the report and the new framework will be used to prepare for the next round of global assessment of progress in 2008.

5. In considering the new indicators, the responsible agencies within the Inter-Agency and Expert Group have been working to provide the data and metadata according to the recommendations made by Member States at previous sessions of the Statistical Commission and of the Group, to ensure the use of the most appropriate methodology and full transparency in the estimates and adjustments made to the data provided by countries.

III. Improving data quality and transparency of methods

6. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group has continued its work to enhance the quality of data and metadata used for the global monitoring of the Millennium Development Goals and to ensure full transparency in the methods used to adjust country data for international comparability and to estimate missing values. On the basis of the recommendations made by countries at the Group meetings in 2005 and 2006, the following areas were addressed:

(a) Identify ways to improve coordination within the national statistical system and countries' reporting mechanisms to the international agencies, in a continuous effort to reduce data gaps and data discrepancies between national and international sources;

(b) Address key methodological issues, including the use of population figures, in the computation of the indicators and regional aggregates;

(c) Continue to improve the content and structure of the metadata and the tools available on the mdgs.un.org website.

7. In order to address the first point, the Statistics Division of the Secretariat undertook a survey, directed at countries participating in the work of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group, to better understand existing ways of coordination within national statistical systems and reporting mechanisms to the international statistical system on Millennium Development Goals indicators and to identify shortcomings and deficiencies in the communication between national statistical authorities and international agencies. The results of the survey were reviewed and discussed at the 12th meeting of the Group in November 2007. The results, although limited in coverage, were used as a basis to recommend further work in this area. In particular, national statisticians in the Group recommended:

(a) That the Statistics Division revise the questionnaire and expand the survey to a larger number of countries;

(b) That the Group, coordinated by the Statistics Division, hold a workshop to review countries' experiences in coordination and reporting mechanisms, identify best practices and develop guidelines for countries.

8. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group also agreed that steps should be taken to reduce data gaps and the inconsistencies between the data available in national sources and used for national monitoring, on the one hand, and the ones available in international data series and used for global monitoring, on the other hand. To this end, it was agreed to involve regional commissions more extensively in data

checking purposes and in serving as a liaison between international agencies and national statistical systems by channelling and following up on specific queries on data and metadata.

9. National statisticians in the Inter-Agency and Expert Group had previously agreed that imputations, if produced with the full involvement of the national statistical system and when accompanied by clear and transparent metadata, are useful to countries because they can be used when no official statistics are available. Statistical teams in the regional commissions will help establish mechanisms to facilitate countries' involvement in the estimation and adjustment of national data and promote more extensive consultation processes between countries and international agencies.

10. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group has also continued the review of methodologies for the production of Millennium Development Goals indicators and has addressed important methodological issues. One such issue relates to the use of population figures in the computation of the indicators and in the aggregation of national values to regional and global figures. The Statistics Division conducted a survey among all agencies producing Millennium Development Goals indicators to better understand what population figures are being used and issues of discrepancies. The Group reviewed and discussed the results and made specific recommendations. It was agreed that efforts should be made to improve the consultation process between the Population Division of the Secretariat and the national statistical offices.

11. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group has also devoted increased attention to ensure the achievement of the desired levels of consistency and transparency in reporting and presenting data and metadata for the international monitoring. In this respect, the Group has agreed that the adoption of the common platform for data exchange, the Statistical Data and Metadata Exchange (SDMX) would be a good technical solution to this issue. The Group has established a task team on SDMX, which has already initiated its work to develop the data structure for Millennium Development Goals indicators to be used to exchange data and metadata among agencies.

IV. Enabling countries to have the necessary data and methodologies to monitor Millennium Development Goals at the national level

12. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group has continued to work to help ensure that countries have access to the necessary tools to monitor the Millennium Development Goals at the national level. In particular, in 2007, it has agreed to produce a revised version of the handbook on indicators, which will also be available online, and an upgrading of the website and the presentation of the metadata. It has also initiated a discussion with the countries in the Group to address other important issues related to monitoring at the national level, in particular:

(a) The need for data to inform policies on Millennium Development Goals and related monitoring of progress at the subnational level;

(b) The need to develop tools to assess progress in the various goals and targets at the national level.

V. Outputs by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators in 2007

13. On the basis of the inputs provided by the various responsible agencies, the Department of Economic and Social Affairs of the Secretariat published the Millennium Development Goals report 2007.[2] The report was launched in July 2007 by the Secretary-General at the opening of the Economic and Social Council, and used to inform the political debate at the high-level segment of the Council in July and in the General Assembly in September 2007. The report was translated in all official languages and launched at regional and subregional events in various countries around the world.

14. The assessment of progress based on regional aggregates was also presented in the Millennium Development Goals: 2007 progress chart. The colour-coded chart, produced for the fourth consecutive year, presents an assessment of regional trends and indicates regions and subregions that are on- or off-track in the achievement of the Goals. It is easy to read and is intended for wide dissemination.

15. A brief report on the Millennium Development Goals in Africa was also launched by the Deputy Secretary-General in June, timed to coincide with the opening of the Group of 8 (G-8) Summit in Germany. At the Summit, the Secretary-General put forward for discussion the question of implementation of the Goals in sub-Saharan Africa.

16. The Statistics Division also prepared data and analysis for the aforementioned 2007 report of the Secretary-General to the General Assembly on the work of the Organization and its statistical annex. The Division has continued to maintain the website and database of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group (http://mdgs.un.org).

17. In September 2007, the Statistics Division, in collaboration with the DevInfo group, issued the third edition of MDGInfo, an adaptation of DevInfo, a technology specifically designed to support Governments in Millennium Development Goals monitoring. MDGInfo is intended to facilitate access to the database and the Millennium Development Goals Report by users with limited access to the Internet and aims at supporting Member States in the use of common database systems and platforms.

VI. Conclusions and way forward

18. **The Statistics Division, in its role as coordinating agency of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on Millennium Development Goals Indicators, will continue to work with the agencies and countries to improve the coverage, transparency and reporting on all Millennium Development Goals indicators and to assist countries with the production and use of data for national monitoring.**

19. **The Statistical Commission may wish to note the work done by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group and the Statistics Division in 2007 in implementing the recommendations contained in Economic and Social Council**

[2] *The Millennium Development Goals Report 2007* (United Nations publication, Sales No. E.07.I.15).

resolution 2006/6 on strengthening statistical capacity, adopted by the Council in July 2006, and the proposed next steps:

(a) Continue to ensure that country participants regularly attend the fall meeting of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group and advise the Group and the Statistics Division on their work to continuously improve the metadata and the methodologies used in estimates and imputations, and on ways to improve the effectiveness of capacity-building activities;

(b) Initiate work with the regional commissions to review, in consultation with countries, estimates and country data adjustments produced by international agencies and identify ways to resolve discrepancies between international and national data;

(c) Assist countries in identifying best practices for coordination within national statistical systems and reporting mechanisms to the international statistical system and formulate the related guidelines.

Annex I

Revised Millennium Development Goals monitoring framework, including new targets and indicators

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and targets (from the Millennium Declaration)	*Indicators for monitoring progress*
Goal 1: Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger	
Target 1.A: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than $1 a day	1.1. Proportion of population below $1 purchasing power parity (PPP) per day[a]
	1.2. Poverty gap ratio
	1.3. Share of poorest quintile in national consumption
Target 1.B: Achieve full and productive employment and decent work for all, including women and young people	1.4. Growth rate of gross domestic product (GDP) per person employed
	1.5. Employment-to-population ratio
	1.6. Proportion of employed people living below $1 (PPP) per day
	1.7. Proportion of own-account and contributing family workers in total employment
Target 1.C: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger	1.8. Prevalence of underweight children under 5 years of age
	1.9. Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption
Goal 2: Achieve universal primary education	
Target 2.A: Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling	2.1. Net enrolment ratio in primary education
	2.2. Proportion of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary
	2.3. Literacy rate of 15-24 year-olds, women and men

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and targets (from the Millennium Declaration)	*Indicators for monitoring progress*
Goal 3: Promote gender equality and empower women	
Target 3.A: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education, preferably by 2005, and in all levels of education no later than 2015	3.1. Ratios of girls to boys in primary, secondary and tertiary education
	3.2. Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector
	3.3. Proportion of seats held by women in national parliament
Goal 4: Reduce child mortality	
Target 4.A: Reduce by two thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-5 mortality rate	4.1. Under-5 mortality rate
	4.2. Infant mortality rate
	4.3. Proportion of 1-year-old children immunized against measles
Goal 5: Improve maternal health	
Target 5.A: Reduce by three quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio	5.1. Maternal mortality ratio
	5.2. Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel
	5.3. Contraceptive prevalence rate
Target 5.B: Achieve, by 2015, universal access to reproductive health	5.4. Adolescent birth rate
	5.5. Antenatal care coverage (at least one visit and at least four visits)
	5.6. Unmet need for family planning
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases	
Target 6.A: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the spread of HIV/AIDS	6.1. HIV prevalence among population aged 15-24 years
	6.2. Condom use at last high-risk sex
	6.3. Proportion of population aged 15-24 years with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS
	6.4. Ratio of school attendance of orphans to school attendance of non-orphans aged 10-14 years

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and targets (from the Millennium Declaration)	*Indicators for monitoring progress*
Target 6.B: Achieve, by 2010, universal access to treatment for HIV/AIDS for all those who need it	6.5. Proportion of population with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs
Target 6.C: Have halted by 2015 and begun to reverse the incidence of malaria and other major diseases	6.6. Incidence and death rates associated with malaria
	6.7. Proportion of children under 5 sleeping under insecticide-treated bednets and proportion of children under 5 with fever who are treated with appropriate antimalarial drugs
	6.8. Incidence, prevalence and death rates associated with tuberculosis
	6.9. Proportion of tuberculosis cases detected and cured under directly observed treatment short course
Goal 7: Ensure environmental sustainability	
Target 7.A: Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programmes and reverse the loss of environmental resources	7.1. Proportion of land area covered by forest
	7.2. Carbon dioxide emissions, total, per capita and per $ GDP (PPP), and consumption of ozone-depleting substances
	7.3. Proportion of fish stocks within safe biological limits
	7.4. Proportion of total water resources used
Target 7.B: Reduce biodiversity loss, achieving, by 2010, a significant reduction in the rate of loss	7.5. Proportion of terrestrial and marine areas protected
	7.6. Proportion of species threatened with extinction
Target 7.C: Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation	7.7. Proportion of population using an improved drinking water source
	7.8. Proportion of population using an improved sanitation facility
Target 7.D: By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum-dwellers	7.9. Proportion of urban population living in slums[b]

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and targets (from the Millennium Declaration)	*Indicators for monitoring progress*

Goal 8: Develop a global partnership for development

Target 8.A: Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system

Includes a commitment to good governance, development and poverty reduction — both nationally and internationally

Target 8.B: Address the special needs of the least developed countries

Includes: tariff and quota-free access for the least developed countries' exports; enhanced programme of debt relief for heavily indebted poor countries (HIPC) and cancellation of official bilateral debt; and more generous official development assistance (ODA) for countries committed to poverty reduction

Target 8.C: Address the special needs of landlocked developing countries and small island developing States (through the Programme of Action for the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States and the outcome of the twenty-second special session of the General Assembly)

Target 8.D: Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term

Some of the indicators listed below are monitored separately for the least developed countries, Africa, landlocked developing countries and small island developing States

Official development assistance (ODA)

8.1. Net ODA, total and to the least developed countries, as percentage of Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development/Development Assistance Committee donors' gross national income

8.2. Proportion of total bilateral, sector-allocable ODA of OECD/DAC donors to basic social services (basic education, primary health care, nutrition, safe water and sanitation)

8.3. Proportion of bilateral official development assistance of OECD/DAC donors that is untied

8.4. ODA received in landlocked developing countries as a proportion of their gross national incomes

8.5. ODA received in small island developing States as a proportion of their gross national incomes

Market access

8.6. Proportion of total developed country imports (by value and excluding arms) from developing countries and least developed countries, admitted free of duty

8.7. Average tariffs imposed by developed countries on agricultural products and textiles and clothing from developing countries

Millennium Development Goals	
Goals and targets (from the Millennium Declaration)	*Indicators for monitoring progress*
	8.8. Agricultural support estimate for OECD countries as a percentage of their gross domestic product
	8.9. Proportion of ODA provided to help build trade capacity
	Debt sustainability
	8.10. Total number of countries that have reached their HIPC decision points and number that have reached their HIPC completion points (cumulative)
	8.11. Debt relief committed under HIPC and Multilateral Debt Relief Initiatives
	8.12. Debt service as a percentage of exports of goods and services
Target 8.E: In cooperation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable essential drugs in developing countries	8.13. Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis
Target 8.F: In cooperation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications	8.14. Telephone lines per 100 population
	8.15. Cellular subscribers per 100 population
	8.16. Internet users per 100 population

[a] For monitoring country poverty trends, indicators based on national poverty lines should be used, where available.

[b] The actual proportion of people living in slums is measured by a proxy, represented by the urban population living in households with at least one of the following four characteristics: (a) lack of access to improved water supply; (b) lack of access to improved sanitation; (c) overcrowding (three or more persons per room); and (d) dwellings made of non-durable material.

Annex II

Assessment of country data availability in the Millennium Development Goals indicators database

1. Table 1 presents the country data availability by goal in the Millennium Development Goals indicators database. The information is based only on the "official" Millennium Development Goals indicators, with information, as of November 2007, for a total of 163 countries in the developing regions.

Table 1
Country data availability in the Millennium Development Goals indicators database

Millennium Development Goals	*Indicators*	*All data, including estimates*				*Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding modelled data by agency*	
		Countries with at least 1 data point		*Countries with at least 2 data points*			
		Number	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*
Goal 1	Population below $1 (PPP) per day, percentage	70	43	57	35	57	35
	Poverty gap ratio at $1 a day (PPP), percentage	70	43	56	34	56	34
	Poorest quintile's share in national income or consumption, percentage	79	48	58	36	58	36
	Children under 5 moderately or severely underweight, percentage	113	69	72	44	72	44
	Population undernourished, percentage	121	74	121	74	121	74
Goal 2	Total net enrolment ratio in primary education, both sexes	152	93	123	75	123	75
	Percentage of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary, both sexes	152	93	104	64	104	64
	Primary completion rate, both sexes	152	93	129	79	129	79
Goal 3	Literacy rates of 15-24 years old, both sexes, percentage	112	69	63	39	47	29
	Gender Parity Index in primary-level enrolment	152	93	144	88	144	88
	Gender Parity Index in secondary-level enrolment	152	93	142	87	142	87
	Gender Parity Index in tertiary-level enrolment	152	93	114	70	114	70
	Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector	149	91	100	61	100	61
	Seats held by women in national parliament, percentage	134	82	134	82	134	82

Millennium Development Goals	Indicators	All data, including estimates				Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding modelled data by agency	
		Countries with at least 1 data point		Countries with at least 2 data points			
		Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage
Goal 4	Children under 5 mortality rate per 1,000 live births	138	85	138	85	138	85
	Infant mortality rate (0-1 year) per 1,000 live births	138	85	138	85	138	85
	Children 1 year old immunized against measles, percentage	139	85	139	85	139	85
Goal 5	Maternal mortality ratio per 100,000 live births	133	82	131	80	63	39
	Births attended by skilled health personnel, percentage	138	85	24	15	24	15
Goal 6	People living with HIV, 15-49 years old, percentage	117	72	98	60	98	60
	Condom use to overall contraceptive use among currently married women 15-49 years old, percentage	109	67	78	48	78	48
	Condom use at last high-risk sex, 15-24 years old, men, percentage	39	24	19	12	19	12
	Condom use at last high-risk sex, 15-24 years old, women, percentage	48	29	22	13	22	13
	Men 15-24 years old with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS, percentage	37	23	7	4	7	4
	Women 15-24 years old with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS, percentage	62	38	0	0	0	0
	Contraceptive use among currently married women 15-49 years old, any method, percentage	111	68	82	50	82	50
	Ratio of school attendance rate of orphans to school attendance rate of non-orphans	63	39	35	21	35	21
	Children under 5 sleeping under insecticide-treated bednets, percentage	49	30	8	5	8	5
	Children under 5 with fever being treated with antimalarial drugs, percentage	48	29	12	7	12	7
	Tuberculosis death rate per 100,000 population	162	99	155	95	155	95
	Tuberculosis prevalence rate per 100,000 population	162	99	155	95	155	95
	Tuberculosis treatment success rate under the directly observed treatment short course (DOTS), percentage	30	18	23	14	23	14
	Tuberculosis detection rate under DOTS, percentage	162	99	143	88	143	88

Millennium Development Goals	*Indicators*	*All data, including estimates*				*Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding modelled data by agency*	
		Countries with at least 1 data point		*Countries with at least 2 data points*			
		Number	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*
Goal 7	Land area covered by forest, percentage	158	97	155	95	155	95
	Protected area to total surface area, percentage	135	83	132	81	132	81
	Carbon dioxide emissions, metric tons of carbon dioxide per capita	150	92	150	92	150	92
	Consumption of all ozone-depleting substances in ODP metric tons	136	83	135	83	135	83
	Proportion of the population using improved drinking water sources, total	162	99	110	67	110	67
	Proportion of the population using improved sanitation facilities, total	162	99	104	64	104	64
	Slum population as percentage of urban, percentage	158	97	105	64	105	64
Goal 8	Debt service as percentage of exports of goods and services and net income from abroad	145	89	107	66	107	66
	Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, both sexes	89	55	65	40	65	40
	Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, women	88	54	63	39	63	39
	Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, men	88	54	63	39	63	39
	Telephone lines per 100 population	157	96	157	96	0	0
	Cellular subscribers per 100 population	157	96	156	96	0	0
	Internet users per 100 population	153	94	151	93	0	0
	Personal computers per 100 population	126	77	123	75	123	75

2. The indicators presented in table 1 have been grouped into four clusters, defined on the basis of country coverage:

(a) Indicators for which less than 25 per cent of the countries in developing regions have at least two data points, excluding modelled data by agency (see table 2). These are indicators on which few countries collect data for their national monitoring on a regular basis

Table 2

Indicators in cluster (a)	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 1 data point — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies — Number	Percentage
Women 15-24 years old with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS, percentage	62	38	0	0	0	0
Telephone lines per 100 population	157	96	157	96	0	0
Cellular subscribers per 100 population	157	96	156	96	0	0
Internet users per 100 population	153	94	151	93	0	0
Men 15-24 years old with comprehensive correct knowledge of HIV/AIDS, percentage	37	23	7	4	7	4
Children under 5 sleeping under insecticide-treated bednets, percentage	49	30	8	5	8	5
Children under 5 with fever being treated with antimalarial drugs, percentage	48	29	12	7	12	7
Condom use at last high-risk sex, 15-24 years old, men, percentage	39	24	19	12	19	12
Condom use at last high-risk sex, 15-24 years old, women, percentage	48	29	22	13	22	13
Tuberculosis treatment success rate under DOTS, percentage	30	18	23	14	23	14
Births attended by skilled health personnel, percentage	138	85	24	15	24	15
Ratio of school attendance rate of orphans to school attendance rate of non-orphans	63	39	35	21	35	21

(b) Indicators for which between 25 per cent and 49 per cent of the countries in developing regions have at least two data points, excluding modelled data by agency (see table 3)

Table 3

Indicators in cluster (b)	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 1 data point — Number	Percentage	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 2 data points — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies — Number	Percentage
Literacy rates of 15-24 years old, both sexes, percentage	112	69	63	39	47	29
Poverty gap ratio at $1 a day (PPP), percentage	70	43	56	34	56	34
Population below $1 (PPP) per day, percentage	70	43	57	35	57	35
Poorest quintile's share in national income or consumption, percentage	79	48	58	36	58	36
Maternal mortality ratio per 100,000 live births	133	82	131	80	63	39
Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, both sexes	89	55	65	40	65	40
Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, women	88	54	63	39	63	39
Youth unemployment rate, aged 15-24, men	88	54	63	39	63	39
Children under 5 moderately or severely underweight, percentage	113	69	72	44	72	44
Condom use to overall contraceptive use among currently married women 15-49 years old, percentage	109	67	78	48	78	48

(c) Indicators for which between 50 per cent and 74 per cent of the countries in developing regions have at least two data points, excluding modelled data by agency (see table 4)

Table 4

Indicators in cluster (c)	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 1 data point — Number	Percentage	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 2 data points — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies — Number	Percentage
Contraceptive use among currently married women 15-49 years old, any method, percentage	111	68	82	50	82	50
People living with HIV, 15-49 years old, percentage	117	72	98	60	98	60
Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector	149	91	100	61	100	61
Percentage of pupils starting grade 1 who reach last grade of primary, both sexes	152	93	104	64	104	64
Proportion of the population using improved sanitation facilities, total	162	99	104	64	104	64
Slum population as percentage of urban, percentage	158	97	105	64	105	64
Debt service as percentage of exports of goods and services and net income from abroad	145	89	107	66	107	66

Indicators in cluster (c)	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 1 data point — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies — Number	Percentage
Proportion of the population using improved drinking water sources, total	162	99	110	67	110	67
Gender parity index in tertiary-level enrolment	152	93	114	70	114	70
Population undernourished, percentage	121	74	121	74	121	74

(d) Indicators for which between 75 per cent or more of the countries in developing regions have at least two data points, excluding modelled data by agency (see table 5). Indicators in this cluster include some of those based on data from administrative sources — such as on education — and some of the key indicators on health and environment, for which most countries produce data regularly.

Table 5

Indicators in cluster (d)	All data including estimates modelled by agencies: Countries with at least 1 data point — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points — Number	Percentage	Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies — Number	Percentage
Total net enrolment ratio in primary education, both sexes	152	93	123	75	123	75
Personal computers per 100 population	126	77	123	75	123	75
Primary completion rate, both sexes	152	93	129	79	129	79
Protected area to total surface area, percentage	135	83	132	81	132	81
Seats held by women in national parliament, percentage	134	82	134	82	134	82
Consumption of all ozone-depleting substances in ODP metric tons	136	83	135	83	135	83
Children under 5 mortality rate per 1,000 live births	138	85	138	85	138	85
Infant mortality rate (0-1 year) per 1,000 live births	138	85	138	85	138	85
Children 1 year old immunized against measles, percentage	139	85	139	85	139	85
Gender parity index in secondary-level enrolment	152	93	142	87	142	87
Tuberculosis detection rate under DOTS, percentage	162	99	143	88	143	88
Gender parity index in primary-level enrolment	152	93	144	88	144	88
Carbon dioxide emissions, metric tons of carbon dioxide per capita	150	92	150	92	150	92

Indicators in cluster (d)	*All data including estimates modelled by agencies*				*Countries with at least 2 data points, excluding estimates modelled by agencies*	
	Countries with at least 1 data point		*Countries with at least 2 data points*			
	Number	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*	*Number*	*Percentage*
Tuberculosis death rate per 100,000 population	162	99	155	95	155	95
Tuberculosis prevalence rate per 100,000 population	162	99	155	95	155	95
Land area covered by forest, percentage	158	97	155	95	155	95

Technical notes

The following indicators have not been considered in the report because there is no reporting on them:

(a) Notified cases of malaria per 100,000 population;

(b) Malaria death rate per 100,000 population;

(c) Population with access to essential drugs.

The following indicators have not been considered in the report because they are used only at the aggregate level (no country data):

(a) Average tariffs on (i) textiles; (ii) clothing; and (iii) agricultural products;

(b) Developed country imports from developing countries and from least developed countries, admitted duty free.

Indicators under Goal 8 referring to ODA and debt relief under the Heavily Indebted Poor Countries initiative have not been considered in the report.

Annex III

Summary of the recommendations by the Inter-Agency and Expert Group at its 12th meeting, held in Paris from 14 to 16 November 2007

1. The 12th meeting of the Inter-Agency and Expert Group on the Millennium Development Goals Indicators was organized in two parts. The first part was held on 14 November 2007 and was attended by 31 experts from 14 agencies and 3 regional commissions. The second part was held on 15 and 16 November and was attended by 17 representatives of national statistical offices from 14 countries, 45 experts from 18 agencies, 4 regional commissions, 2 representatives from donor agencies and 1 representative from the European Commission.

2. The first part of the meeting:

(a) Agreed on the numbering of targets and indicators for the new Millennium Development Goal framework;

(b) Provided recommendations for improving the coordination between regional commissions and international agencies;

(c) Proposed new Millennium Development Goals outputs for 2008 and outlined the timeline for the 2008 Goals outputs;

(d) Agreed on a provisional workplan and timeline for the completion of an updated version of the Handbook on Millennium Development Goals Indicators;

(e) Reviewed and provided directions for the work of the SDMX-Millennium Development Goals and the progress chart task teams;

(f) Reviewed metadata availability on the Millennium Development Goals website;

(g) Discussed plans for the next Inter-Agency and Expert Group meeting, to be held tentatively in March 2008, with the main objectives of finalizing the outline of the Handbook on Millennium Development Goals Indicators and agreeing on the list and content of the 2008 Goals outputs.

3. The second part of the meeting, attended by country representatives:

(a) Reviewed and discussed the role of the regional agencies in addressing the differences between national and international data and identified ways to reduce these discrepancies;

(b) Reviewed and discussed national reporting mechanisms to provide data from countries to international agencies;

(c) Discussed strategies to improve the availability of reliable Millennium Development Goals data at the subnational level;

(d) Reviewed metadata presented in the mdgs.un.org database and made recommendations for the revision of the Handbook on Millennium Development Goals Indicators.

4. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group reviewed the results of a survey on coordination of reporting mechanisms carried out among international agencies and countries participating in the meeting and recommended that:

(a) The number of duplicated requests received by countries from international agencies should be reduced;

(b) Differences among countries in institutional arrangements for reporting data should be taken into account in the strategies for improving coordination of reporting;

(c) The questionnaire used for the survey on coordination of reporting mechanisms should be improved, with clearer questions and allowing more time for countries to reply. The revised questionnaire should also include questions on coordination in reporting of data for Millennium Development Goals country reports to the team responsible for its production. After the questionnaire is revised, the survey should be extended to countries outside the Group;

(d) The Statistical Division should take the lead in organizing a workshop for countries to share experiences on coordination of statistical systems, with the objective of identifying best practices and working towards the development of guidelines.

5. On the issue of coordination of reporting mechanisms for Millennium Development Goals data, the Inter-Agency and Expert Group also recommended the following:

(a) The coordination of reporting mechanisms for the Millennium Development Goals data should involve the overall national statistical system and the overall reporting of data to international agencies;

(b) The role of the Millennium Development Goals national focal points should be clearly defined in order to facilitate the setting up of mechanisms for monitoring and reporting on the Goals. National focal points may have different roles depending on the national arrangements for the production, dissemination and reporting of data. There should also be a system of official national focal points in charge of providing guidance and disseminating data (this would involve sharing information on contact persons in line ministries and explaining data sources);

(c) It is necessary to improve coordination among international agencies to reduce duplicated requests. For example, international agencies could use combined questionnaires;

(d) The implementation of a repository of data on the Millennium Development Goals indicators should include securing the necessary resources and technical expertise and ensuring a strong national capacity to produce reliable data;

(e) There should be improved training for countries on Millennium Development Goals databases, especially DevInfo;

(f) A standardized source of metadata for Millennium Development Goals should be developed and used in countries;

(g) Regional workshops should be held to review recommendations for Millennium Development Goals reporting and standardized country reports. In

addition, the national statistical office should be fully involved in the production of the Millennium Development Goals country reports;

(h) United Nations regional commissions should study the situation in each country in their region in order to assess the statistical capacity of relevant institutions and existing coordination mechanisms within countries.

6. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group also discussed the issue of discrepancies between data at the national and international levels and recommended the following:

(a) The United Nations regional commissions, with the coordination of the Statistics Division and the assistance of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), which will help establish the contacts with the international agencies, will initiate a study to investigate the reasons for discrepancies between national and international data, and for data gaps, for a group of two or three selected countries in their region. The selected countries should preferably include countries that are a part of the Group. International agencies should collaborate with the regional commissions in helping to understand the causes of data discrepancies. The results of these studies should be reported to the Group meeting on Millennium Development Goals Indicators, planned for November 2008;

(b) The United Nations regional commissions should serve as a bridge between countries and international agencies;

(c) Expert group meetings should be organized to establish strategies for dealing with data discrepancies and data gaps at the national and international levels. These meetings should count on the participation of international agencies, United Nations regional commissions, regional offices of international agencies, national statistical offices and other relevant institutions of the national statistical systems. The Statistics Division and UNDP will work together to organize these meetings;

(d) Technical assistance should be provided to countries in the use of international definitions. Compliance with international definitions will help to harmonize national and international data;

(e) Metadata of nationally produced data should be improved so that users at the international level can understand the methodology behind the data;

(f) Guidelines on the information flow of Millennium Development Goals data should be developed;

(g) International agencies should consult with countries before publishing their data.

7. The Inter-Agency and Expert Group also recognized that subnational data is needed for understanding Millennium Development Goals trends within countries and in order to better allocate resources across different population groups and regional areas. In order to improve the availability of reliable subnational data, the participants recommended the following:

(a) Develop recommendations on the use of censuses to localize the Millennium Development Goals as well as the use of small area estimations when data are not available;

(b) Investigate the availability of subnational data.

8. Finally, the Inter-Agency and Expert Group reviewed the metadata currently available in the Millennium Development Goals database maintained by the Statistics Division (available at http://mdgs.un.org). Experts from countries and international agencies recommended that:

(a) The metadata field explaining reasons for discrepancies between national and international sources should be included in the next revision of the Handbook on Millennium Development Goals Indicators;

(b) The next revision of the Handbook on Millennium Development Goals Indicators should be better disseminated among national statistical offices and Millennium Development Goals country teams.